



**RESPONSE TO EXAMINERS WRITTEN QUESTIONS**

On behalf of

**GREENSFORGE SAILING CLUB**

**DEADLINE SUBMISSION 2: 5<sup>TH</sup> APRIL 2019**

## CONTENTS

<b>Response to ExA Question 1.14.4</b>		
1.14.4.(i)	Numbers and Age Profiles of Groups using the reservoir	Page 3
1.14.4.(ii)	Details of organisations using the reservoir	Page 3
1.14.4.(iii)	Frequency and Duration of Sailing Activities	Page 4
1.14.4.(iv)	Trends in Membership	Page 6
<b>Response to ExA Question 1.14.7</b>		
1.14.7(i)	Adequacy and validity of Wind Impact on Sailing Report	Page 7
1.14.7 (v & vi)	Impact of Tree Cover	Page 7
1.14.7(x – xiii)	Assessment of Wind Impact Arising from Development	Page 8
1.14.7 (xiv)	Expert Evidence on Wind Impact arising from buildings	Page 8
	Response to ExA Question 1.14.9	Page 9

**QUESTION 1.14.4.**

The Examining Authority has requested details on:

- i) the number and age profile of its membership,
- ii) the number of other groups/organisations using the reservoir for sailing and sailing training purposes,
- iii) an indication of the frequency and duration of sailing/training use and the number of people likely to be making use of the reservoir at any one time;
- iv) an indication of recent and expected future trends in the level of membership of the Club and the level of use of the reservoir for sailing purposes.

The response is set out as follows:

**1.14.4. i)**

**Numbers and Age profiles of groups using the Reservoir on a regular basis is as follows:**

	<b>Adults</b>	<b>Juniors (under 18)</b>	<b>Social Members</b>
Greensforge Sailing Club	22 <sup>1</sup>	6	20
Sandwell Sea Cadets	5	40 <sup>2</sup>	
1 <sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts	15	55 <sup>3</sup>	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>79</b>	<b>101</b>	<b>20</b>

**1.14.4.ii)**

**Details of organisations utilising the reservoir for sailing and training**

In addition to the Sailing Club itself, the site is primarily used by Sandwell Sea Cadets and 1<sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts (based in Cannock).

**Sandwell Sea Cadets**

The Sandwell Sea Cadets utilise the site fortnightly on Sundays, as well as practising and training on the reservoir. There are regularly approx. 15 Cadets, 4 staff and additional parents attending these sessions. In addition to sailing, the Cadets also utilise the water for Pulling Boats and Paddleboarding.

---

<sup>1</sup> Cadets and Scouts are included as full memberships but excluded from these figures. Full memberships also include family memberships, so total membership comprises 53 individuals.

<sup>2</sup> Age range for Sea Cadets is 10 - 18

<sup>3</sup> Membership consists of 15 Beavers (aged 6-8), 20 Cubs (aged 8-10.5), 16 Scouts (aged 10 – 14) and 4 Explorers (aged 14 -18)

Attendance at the Sailing Club has enabled the Cadets to sail successfully in regattas, resulting in additional equipment being provided to them by the Ministry of Defence.

### 1<sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts

1<sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts are one of 105 Royal Navy recognised Sea Scout units across the Country and is subject to regular inspection by Royal Navy Officers. They sail weekly during the summer on Wednesday evenings, with approx. 20 Scouts in attendance, and their involvement in weekend sailing is actively encouraged by the Club.

In addition to the sailing programme they also utilise the reservoir for Canoeing, Kayaking and more recently Stand-Up Paddleboarding

#### 1.14.4.iii) Frequency and Duration of Sailing Activities

##### Regular Sailing

The Club is licensed to sail at weekends on a year round basis, and on Wednesday evenings during the summer. Sailing is not undertaken during January and February due weather conditions which potentially preclude enjoyable (and safe) sailing, and to avoid those occasions when the reservoir may freeze.

In general, the sailing timetable is as follows:

	<b>Period</b>	<b>Amount of sailing</b>	<b>Regular no of sailors</b>
Sundays	Oct/Nov/Dec/Mar	3 x 1 hour races	Average of 8 Greensforge Members <sup>4</sup>
	April – September	4 x 1 hour races	Approx 12 Greensforge Members <sup>4</sup> 15 Sea Cadets + 5 staff
Wednesdays	April – September	Practice session	Average 4 Greensforge Members <sup>4</sup> 20 Sea Scouts + Staff 4-5 Sea Cadets
Saturdays	Mar – Dec	Generally Training events, open days etc and additional sailing	

<sup>4</sup> Average figures presented as weather conditions, commitments and public events can impact on attendance

## Additional Activities

In addition to the above, the following activities are undertaken:

Activity	Description	Frequency	Attendance
RYA Learn to Sail	RYA recognised course leading to formal qualification for adults and youths alike. Comprises 16 hours training run over a weekend	2x per annum (June and August)	12 per course
'Push the Boat Out'	RYA sponsored promotion of sailing. Range of activities promoted throughout May aimed at encouraging people to try sailing	1 per annum	10 – 60 <sup>5</sup>
Open Day	Club based activity day including taster sessions to encourage new membership and promote training courses.	1 per annum	10 – 60 <sup>6</sup>
Moth Training Day	International Moth Dinghy's are a technical boat, with a very slim hull, wings and a large sail. The training weekend I 2018 attracted other Moth sailors from around the Country and will be repeated in future years with attendance expected to increase	1 per annum (currently)	12
Next Step	A group catering for Young Adults with Learning Difficulties. They have been supported by Rotary Club to attend the Sailing Club for the last 8 years, giving their members the opportunity to try sailing with the Club	1 per annum	12 – 15 plus carers
Taster Sessions	Attendance by Scout Groups have been a regular feature of these days – although in 2019 a Corporate Team Building day is also planned	1 or 2 per annum	Up to 20
Sea Scout Regatta	The 1 <sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts hold their annual regatta at the Club, which offers the full range of watersport activities identified above. Scouts, leaders and families all get involved	1 x per annum	Circa 40
Sandwell Sea Cadet Regatta	The Sea Cadets also hold their annual regatta at Greensforge.	1 x per annum	40 x u18's 12 staff

<sup>5</sup> Event is highly dependent upon weather, so attendance levels vary significantly

<sup>6</sup> Event is highly weather dependent so attendance levels vary significantly

In summary, therefore, it can be estimated that in addition to the regular members of Greensforge Sailing Club who utilise the reservoir, another 200 people could be considered to be benefitting from its use on an annual basis.

#### **1.14.4.(iv) Trends in Membership**

Data for trends in membership for the Sandwell Sea Cadets and 1<sup>st</sup> Blackford Sea Scouts is not currently available, although can be provided if required. Membership data from Greensforge Sailing Club for the period 2014 – 2018 is as follows:

	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Full Membership	27	30	25	32	24
Juniors	1	2	3	4	6
Social Members	16	18	16	16	20

The membership numbers shown represent total registrations. These incorporates the two affiliated Clubs, each registered as one full membership each, in addition to family memberships.

In reality, the numbers of individuals involved are higher than those identified. This is because a family membership whilst registered as one, will generally have more than one person within it. For instance, the 24 memberships identified for 2018 include 53 individual members, plus the Sea Scouts and Cadets (incorporating another 115 individuals)

Club memberships have remained relatively stable over the last few years. The key focus on Club activities aims to ensure the sustainable future of the Club, and the stabilisation of membership levels is a key focus.

Investment in key infrastructure, such as the frontage works, and the youth and training programmes the Club actively promotes are anticipated to result in membership growth, although this will take some time.

Any limitations on sailing that arise as a result of the proposed development will potentially reduce the ability of the Club to achieve these objectives, as loss of sailing quality and safety will result interest in sailing at Greensforge.

### **Response to ExA Question 1.14.7**

**The ExA has invited a response from other IP's in addition to the applicant in relation to the adequacy and validity of the applicants' report, Wind Effects on Sailing (APP-113). A number of issues have been raised by the ExA in relation to this report for which clarity is sought.**

#### **Response to point (i)**

Greensforge Sailing Club has previously raised questions over the validity of this desk top study report.

We are particularly concerned that the report is based on generic wind data obtained from Birmingham Airport (some 25 miles away), and that it was undertaken with no apparent understanding of the particular circumstances of the reservoir, its surroundings, and specifically the wind patterns that effect the reservoir directly.

We also note that there was no engagement directly with any members of the Sailing Club to obtain a relevant knowledge and understanding of the nature of sailing undertaken, and the impact that wind conditions may have on sailing activity and safety. It is not clear whether the consultants involved have any specific experience of addressing wind impact in relation to sailing from other work conducted elsewhere.

The lack of understanding of local circumstances, the generic nature of the information relied upon, and the lack of clarity on the consultants' experience of addressing wind impact on sailing, in our view, raises significant questions on the report's validity.

#### **Response to point (v) and (vi)**

We note that the ExA have questioned the reliability of the assumption of sheltering from the trees as identified on Google Earth. Whilst internet-based searches can occasionally assist in understanding site context, in this instance it is misleading.

We can confirm that there is relatively dense tree coverage to the south of the reservoir. Over recent times, the impact of this coverage has had the impact of restricting sailing due to the lack of wind movement that arises as a result. The area impacted is shown in the plans in our Written Submission.

Along the south-western edge of the reservoir, this tree belt becomes a single line of trees, which has much less dense coverage than the areas further to the south. As a result, wind is able to penetrate through the tree line and does not impact on sailing to any noticeable extent throughout the year, despite the trees being in leaf in the summer months.

We would request that the ExA visits the site to understand these specific circumstances.

### **Response to point (x), (xi), (xii) and (xiii)**

We note that the ExA also questions the extent to which any potential impact has been undertaken in relation to the parameters plan and the potential for building orientation and height to impact upon wind flow.

Subsequent to the Open Floor Hearing, the applicant has advised Greensforge Sailing Club that it intends to undertake Computational Fluid Dynamic (CFD) modelling to consider the impacts of buildings on the wind conditions on the reservoir. They have advised that they intend to share the results of that Study with the Club and are anticipating that a Statement of Common Ground will be forthcoming.

Whilst the Club welcomes the fact that the applicant has chosen to undertake this work, the methodology for undertaking it, together with the outcomes will require review and consideration before any further comment may be offered.

To this extent, we would like to reserve comment on any potential further assessment of wind impact arising as a result of the development until the outcome of the proposed CFD Study is known and understood by the Club.

### **Response to Point (xiv)**

The ExA highlights the suggestion from IP's that 'expert' wisdom on wind impacts arising from buildings extend to circa 30 times the height on the leeward side of the building, and requests evidence to support this.

Our submission highlights details that suggest the impact could be felt over 20 times the height and provides a specific academic reference for this.

Further Google searches indicate that there are significant levels of 'wisdom' on this subject, all of which indicate concur that there is an impact on the leeward side of any obstruction. In general, these documents do not suggest an impact as great as 30 times the height of the obstruction but support our submitted view that it is reasonable to expect impact of up to 20 times, as we have made in our submission.

We will undertake a review of the evidence available from public sources including internet searches and provide a summary of the findings, together with appropriate references to the ExA by Deadline 3 of the Examination timetable (25<sup>th</sup> April).



### **Response to ExA Question 1.14.9**

**The ExA seeks clarity on where the recommendations of the Wind Study have been incorporated into Chapter 14 of the ES, questions the conclusions of the ES, and queries whether the proposed mitigation measures have been addressed within the DCO documents, including the Parameters Plan, or whether any amendment is required to them.**

#### **Response**

Greensforge Sailing Club conclude that the conclusions of Chapter 14 of the ES do not adequately reflect the extent of the potential impact of the development in relation to leisure and amenity receptors, and specifically in respect of the impact of the development on the reservoir and its use for sailing purposes.

Our submission advises that we are not certain what the outcome of any wind tunnel test would achieve, nor what proposals the Applicant would make in terms of mitigating against any identified impact.

We do not believe that the current parameters plan reflects the proposed mitigation as recommended in the report Wind Impact on Sailing. Our submission highlights the reasons why it is considered appropriate for the Parameters Plan to be amended to ensure there is no impact upon sailing activities on the reservoir.

We note the ongoing work proposed by the applicant and wish to reserve our position on this until this work is complete. We will provide further comment on this once the outcome of the work is known.